



Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>

PDAC - Remaining Round 1 Requests for Peter Cramton

Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com>

Sun, Aug 26, 2012 at 6:40 PM

To: Jonathan.Blum@cms.hhs.gov, Sandra Salisbury <Sandra.Salisbury@noridian.com>, michael.marquis@cms.hhs.gov

Cc: Marilyn.Tavener@cms.hhs.gov, pdacfoia <pdacfoia@noridian.com>, "pacharasut@gmail.com" <pacharasut@gmail.com>, "Ballantine, Lorrie T. (CMS/CM)" <Lorrie.Ballantine@cms.hhs.gov>, "Bryson, Joseph P. (CMS/CM)" <Joseph.Bryson@cms.hhs.gov>, "Heath, Paul M. (CMS/CM)" <Paul.Heath@cms.hhs.gov>, "James, Janae R. (CMS/CM)" <Janae.James@cms.hhs.gov>, "Longus, Gina R. (CMS/CM)" <gina.longus@cms.hhs.gov>, Audrey Aberle <Audrey.Aberle@noridian.com>, "Keane, Michael P. (CMS/CM)" <Michael.Keane@cms.hhs.gov>, "McDonald, Rodney P. (CMS/SC)" <Rodney.McDonald@cms.hhs.gov>, Pat Pollert <Pat.Pollert@noridian.com>, Laurie Oyos <Laurie.Oyos@noridian.com>

Dear Jonathan,

Sandie Salisbury informed me that she sent the data I requested in my FOIA request to CMS on August 17. I was hoping by now to either receive the data or receive an explanation for the delay in my receiving the data. Unfortunately, I have received neither. Would you please have someone get back to me with the data or an explanation for the delay?

As you can imagine I would very much like to get on with my research and the data is an essential input.

I have also copied on this email, Michael Marquis, Director of the Freedom of Information Group at CMS, in the hope that that may be helpful.

Many thanks for your prompt consideration.

Kind regards,
Peter

Peter Cramton
pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

Peter,

PDAC shipped your FOIA requests to CMS on August 17, 2012. There was a slight delay beyond the date I projected to you in the email. Thank you.

Sandie Salisbury

Team Leader - Statistical

PDAC - Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

Sandra.Salisbury@noridian.com (701.433.3051)

On Fri, Aug 3, 2012 at 3:34 PM, Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Sandie,

Many thanks for the update on the process.

I have some fear that passing the data through CMS will lead to further delay. As such, I have cc'ed Jonathan Blum and Marilyn Tavernner with the expectation that they will be able to make sure that the data is quickly passed on to me without further delay, since it has already gone through over one month of quality checks. If a delay of more than one week is required by CMS personnel to do additional quality checks, then I ask that CMS send me an email explaining the need for further checks and why these further checks cannot be accomplished in one week.

I very much appreciate the efforts of Noridian and CMS to provide the requested data in a timely manner, so that I can continue my research on a program of great public importance. As you can no doubt appreciate, this type of information is critical for transparency and to understand the impact of the competitive bidding program.

Kind regards,
Peter

Peter Cramton
pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

On Fri, Aug 3, 2012 at 10:21 AM, Sandra Salisbury <Sandra.Salisbury@noridian.com> wrote:

Dr. Cramton,

Your FOIA request is in the final stages of quality checks and will be prepared for release no later than next week. PDAC will release the FOIA requests to CMS and the subsequent release of information to you will be by CMS personnel. If you have any questions or concerns feel free to send an email either to myself or to the pdacfoia@noridian.com mail box. Thank you.

Sandie Salisbury

Team Leader - Statistical

PDAC - Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

Sandra.Salisbury@noridian.com (701.433.3051)

Confidentiality Notice: This e-mail message and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure, distribution or copying is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient(s), please contact the sender by replying to this e-mail and destroy/delete all copies of this e-mail message.

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]

Sent: Wednesday, August 01, 2012 2:57 PM

To: pdacfoia

Cc: pacharasut@gmail.com

Subject: Re: PDAC - Remaining Round 1 Requests for Peter Cramton

Dear Tara,

Can you please give me an update on my FOIA request? I suspect it is nearly done with QC. I would very much like to get the data to Pat for analysis before I head to Germany on August 8. Might this be possible?

Many thanks for your efforts.

Yours,

Peter

Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

On Thu, Jul 12, 2012 at 4:15 PM, Peter Cramton <pcramton@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Tara,

Many thanks for your helpful response. I am eager to get the data and continue with my research, but waiting two more weeks should not be a problem.

Kind regards,

Peter

Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

On Thu, Jul 12, 2012 at 4:07 PM, PDAC FOIA <pdacfoia@noridian.com> wrote:

Dr. Cramton,

I apologize for the delay in delivery of your reports. The analysts assigned to your request have had other Statement of Work (SOW) requirements that have taken priority and created a delay. The reports have been generated and are in the Quality Check process which is quite rigorous. There are currently a few other high priority SOW requirements that must be taken care of prior to work resuming on your request, this could take a couple weeks. The timing of these requests fluctuates and is not able to be anticipated when we are projecting completion dates on FOIA requests. We appreciate your patience.

Thanks,

Tara Odden

Business Analyst I

Pricing, Data Analysis and Coding (PDAC)

Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

pdacfoia@noridian.com

Confidentiality Notice: This communication and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure, distribution or copying is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient(s), please contact the sender by replying to this e-mail and destroy/delete all copies of this e-mail message.

From: Peter Cramton [mailto:pcramton@gmail.com]

Sent: Monday, July 09, 2012 1:37 PM

To: pdacfoia

Cc: pacharasut@gmail.com

Subject: Re: PDAC - Remaining Round 1 Requests for Peter Cramton

Dear Tara,

Can you give me an update on the FOIA reports? You estimated delivery would be at the end of June.

Many thanks,

Peter

Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

On Fri, May 25, 2012 at 3:02 PM, PDAC FOIA <pdacfoia@noridian.com> wrote:

Peter,

The FOIA reports are in a quality check at this time. The estimated date of delivery is the end of June.

Thanks,

Tara Odden

Business Analyst I

Pricing, Data Analysis and Coding (PDAC)

Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

pdacfoia@noridian.com

Confidentiality Notice: This communication and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure, distribution or copying is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient(s), please contact the sender by replying to this e-mail and destroy/delete all copies of this e-mail message.

From: Peter Cramton [<mailto:pcramton@gmail.com>]
Sent: Thursday, May 24, 2012 10:52 AM
To: pdacfoia
Cc: pacharasut@gmail.com
Subject: Re: PDAC - Remaining Round 1 Requests for Peter Cramton

Dear Tara,

I am wondering how this FOIA request is progressing?

Many thanks,

Peter

Peter Cramton

pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu +1 240 479 9345

On Wed, Mar 21, 2012 at 9:53 AM, PDAC FOIA <pdacfoia@noridian.com> wrote:

Peter,

Please review the attached ad hoc request forms for 2008, 2009, and 2010 for Round 1 for your request. Please reply with suggested edits or your approval.

Thanks,

Tara Odden

Business Analyst I

Pricing, Data Analysis and Coding (PDAC)

Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

pdacfoia@noridian.com

Confidentiality Notice: This communication and any attachments are for the sole use of the intended recipient(s) and may contain confidential and privileged information. Any unauthorized review, use, disclosure, distribution or copying is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient(s), please contact the sender by replying to this e-mail and destroy/delete all copies of this e-mail message.

DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH & HUMAN SERVICES
Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services
1301 Young Street, Room 714
Dallas, Texas 75202



8/23/2012

Peter Cramton
University of Maryland
Department of Economics

College Park MD 20742-7211

Doc. # 082320127041 PINTT82

Dear Peter Cramton:

This letter is in response to your Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) request to the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) dated 3/3/2012. You requested copies of Procedure Code Utilization Data - DMEPOS Competitive Bidding Program. The documents you requested are not directly releasable by this office; therefore, your request and our response have been forwarded to our central office for final disposition. Any further inquiries regarding your request should be directed to:

Michael S. Marquis, Director
Freedom of Information Division
Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services
Room N2-20-16
7500 Security Blvd.
Baltimore, MD 21244

410-786-5353

Please let us know if the Dallas CMS office can be of further assistance to you.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "mjcollard". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Mary Jane Collard
Freedom of Information Coordinator



**Pricing, Data Analysis
and Coding (PDAC)**

900 42nd Street South
PO Box 6757
Fargo, ND 58103-6757

August 17, 2012

UNIVERSITY OF MARYLAND
DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS
ATTN PETER CRAMTON
COLLEGE PARK MD 20742-7211

Case Number: 62PDAC0021

Xref Number: 18070653

Dear Mr. Cramton:

On March 5, 2012, we received your request for documentation guidelines under the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA), 5 USC 552.

You are advised that the documents requested in your request are not within this region's authority to release to the public. Therefore, this request has been forwarded to the Centers for Medicare & Medicaid (CMS) Regional Office at the address listed below:

MARY JANE COLLARD
FOIA COORDINATOR
CMS - REGION VI
1301 YOUNG ST, ROOM 714
DALLAS TX 75202

(214) 767-6428

If you want information regarding the status of your request, you may write or phone Mary Jane Collard.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Laurie Oyos".

Laurie Oyos
Government Relations Coordinator
PDAC FOIA
www.dmepdac.com

cc: Mary Jane Collard / CMS





Peter Cramton

Professor of Economics

+1 240 479 9345 pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu

3 March 2012

Tara Odden

Pricing, Data Analysis and Coding (PDAC)

Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

pdacadhoc@noridian.com 701.433.3371 fax 701-277-7898

Dear Ms. Odden:

I am requesting Procedure Code Utilization data to continue my research, which is partially funded by the National Science Foundation. I will be using these data for a study examining the market structure of the Medicare DMEPOS market. The purpose of this study is to examine the impact of the DMEPOS Competitive Bidding Program on DMEPOS market structure. **The changes from my prior FOIA are in red.** The prior request was FOIA Case Number 60PDAC0168 - Xref Number 16040460.

I am requesting the following data:

- The total amount submitted for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier
- **The total amount allowed for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier**
- **The total amount denied for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier**
- The number of claim lines submitted
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is allowed
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is denied
- The number of units submitted
- The number of units allowed
- The number of units denied
- **Number of unique beneficiaries**

Aggregated by

- Supplier name, NPI and PTAN
- **Month, Year** (by service date)
- HCPCS
- Modifiers

For all

- Time period: **1/1/2008 – 12/31/2011**
- HCPCS and modifiers
- Jurisdiction in Round 1 (Rebid) and Round 2

In the data file, please provide the following data fields:

- Supplier NPI
- Supplier PTAN
- Supplier Name
- Supplier Zip Code
- Zip code where beneficiary receives the items or maintains permanent residence
- CBA as in Round 1 (Rebid) and Round 2
- Procedure Code
- Procedure Code Description
- Product category as in Round 1 (Rebid) and Round 2
- Month
- Year
- The total amount submitted for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier
- The total amount allowed for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier
- The total amount denied for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier
- The number of claim lines submitted
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is allowed
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is denied
- The number of units submitted
- The number of units allowed
- The number of units denied
- Number of unique beneficiaries

Please send the requested data as a zip file to my email or on a DVD to my office at the University of Maryland:

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics Department
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742

My email address is pcramton@gmail.com. Thank you in advance for your attention to this data request. If you have questions, please contact me via my email or contact Pat Sujarittanonta who is working with me on this project at pacharasut@gmail.com.

Sincerely yours,





Peter Cramton

Professor of Economics

+1 240 479 9345 pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu

7 December 2011

Tara Odden

Pricing, Data Analysis and Coding (PDAC)

Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

pdacadhoc@noridian.com 701.433.3371 fax 701-277-7898

Dear Ms. Odden:

I am requesting Procedure Code Utilization data to continue my research, which is partially funded by the National Science Foundation. Per your suggestion that Service Date, on which the Competitive Bidding Program, is more appropriate measure to assess the program, the request is the same as my prior request (Ad Hoc Number 16066009), except that time period is from 2006 to 2010. I will be using these data for a study examining the market structure of the Medicare DMEPOS market. The purpose of this study is to examine the impact of the DMEPOS Competitive Bidding Program on DMEPOS market structure.

I am requesting the following data:

- The total amount allowed for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier.
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is allowed
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is denied
- The number of claim lines submitted

Aggregated by

- Supplier name, NPI and PTAN
- Year
- HCPCS

For all

- Time period: 1/1/2006 – 12/31/2010
- HCPCS's
- Jurisdiction

In the data file, please provide the following data fields:

- Supplier NPI
- Supplier PTAN
- Supplier Name
- Supplier Zip Code

- Zip code where beneficiary receives the items or maintains permanent residence
- CBA as in Round 1 (Rebid)
- Procedure Code
- Procedure Code Description
- Product category as in Round 1 (Rebid)
- Year
- Number of Claim Lines Allowed
- Number of Claim Lines Denied
- Number of Claim Lines
- Amount Allowed

Please send the requested data on DVD or CD to my office at the University of Maryland:

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics Department
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742

My email address pcramton@gmail.com. Thank you in advance for your attention to this data request. If you have questions, please contact me via my email or contact Pat Sujarittanonta who is working with me on this project at pacharasut@gmail.com.

Sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Peter Cramton". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.



Peter Cramton

Professor of Economics

+1 240 479 9345 pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu

29 August 2011

Tara Odden

Pricing, Data Analysis and Coding (PDAC)

Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

pdacadhoc@noridian.com 701.433.3371 fax 701-277-7898

Dear Ms. Odden:

I am requesting Procedure Code Utilization data to continue my research, which is partially funded by the National Science Foundation. This is the same as my prior request (FOIA ad hoc report 35669), but is for as much of 2011 as you have data. I will be using these data for a study examining the market structure of the Medicare DMEPOS market. The purpose of this study is to examine the impact of the DMEPOS Competitive Bidding Program on DMEPOS market structure.

I am requesting the following data:

- The total amount allowed for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier.
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is allowed
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is denied
- The number of claim lines submitted

Aggregated by

- Supplier name, NPI and PTAN
- Year
- HCPCS

For all

- Time period: 1/1/2011 – 6/30/2011 (or later if available, for example 8/31/2011)
- HCPCS's
- Jurisdiction

In the data file, please provide the following data fields:

- Supplier NPI
- Supplier PTAN
- Supplier Name
- Supplier Zip Code
- Zip code where beneficiary receives the items or maintains permanent residence
- CBA as in Round 1 (Rebid)

- Procedure Code
- Procedure Code Description
- Product category as in Round 1 (Rebid)
- Year
- Number of Claim Lines Allowed
- Number of Claim Lines Denied
- Number of Claim Lines
- Amount Allowed

Please send the requested data on DVD or CD to my office at the University of Maryland:

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics Department
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742

My email address pcramton@gmail.com. Thank you in advance for your attention to this data request. If you have questions, please contact me via my email or contact Pat Sujarittanonta who is working with me on this project at pacharasut@gmail.com.

Sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Peter Cramton". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial 'P' and a long, sweeping underline.



Peter Cramton

Professor of Economics

+1 240 479 9345 pcramton@gmail.com www.cramton.umd.edu

4 April 2011

Tara Odden

Pricing, Data Analysis and Coding (PDAC)

Noridian Administrative Services, LLC

pdacadhoc@noridian.com 701.433.3371 fax 866-209-1236

Dear Ms. Odden:

I am requesting Procedure Code Utilization data to complete my research, which is partially funded by the National Science Foundation. I will be using these data for a study examining the market structure of the Medicare DMEPOS market. The purpose of this study is to examine the impact of the DMEPOS Competitive Bidding Program on DMEPOS market structure.

I am requesting the following data:

- The total amount allowed for reimbursement by Medicare to the Supplier.
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is allowed
- The number of claim lines for which reimbursement is denied
- The number of claim lines submitted

Aggregated by

- Supplier name, NPI and PTAN
- Year
- HCPCS

For all

- Time period: 1/1/2006 – 12/31/2010
- HCPCS's
- Jurisdiction

In the data file, please provide the following data fields:

- Supplier NPI
- Supplier PTAN
- Supplier Name
- Supplier Zip Code
- Zip code where beneficiary receives the items or maintains permanent residence
- CBA as in Round 1 (Rebid)
- Procedure Code

- Procedure Code Description
- Product category as in Round 1 (Rebid)
- Year
- Number of Claim Lines Allowed
- Number of Claim Lines Denied
- Number of Claim Lines
- Amount Allowed

Please send the requested data on DVD or CD to my office at the University of Maryland:

Professor Peter Cramton
Economics Department
University of Maryland
College Park MD 20742

My email address pcramton@gmail.com. Thank you in advance for your attention to this data request. If you have questions, please contact me via my email or contact Pat Sujarittanonta who is working with me on this project at pacharasut@gmail.com.

Sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Peter Cramton". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large initial "P".